

STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LEGAL HISTORY

Freedom's Law and Indigenous Rights:  
From Europe's Oeconomy to the  
Constitutionalism of the Americas

Bartolomé Clavero

The Robbins Collection

Robbins Collection Publications  
School of Law (Boalt Hall)  
University of California at Berkeley  
Berkeley, California 94720  
(510) 642-5094 (510) 642-8325  
<http://www.law.berkeley.edu/robbins>

©2005 by the Regents of the University of California, The Robbins Religious and Civil Law Collection, School of Law (Boalt Hall), University of California at Berkeley.

All Rights Reserved.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 1-882239-16-4

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Clavero, Bartolomé.

Freedom's law and indigenous rights : from Europe's oecumenism to the constitutionalism of the Americas / Bartolomé Clavero.

p. cm.— (Studies in comparative legal history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-882239-16-4 (alk. paper)

1. Indians of North America—Legal status, laws, etc.—History. 2. Indians of Mexico—Legal status, laws, etc.—History. 3. Indigenous peoples—Civil rights—History. I. Title. II. Series.

KF8205.C54 2005

342.7308'72—dc22

2005020182

For Mercedes, otherwise known as *Antidora*



# Contents

Foreword	xi
I. Freedom's Law and Oeconomical Status: The Euro-American Constituent Moment	1
Constitution in time	3
Experiment in method	5
Individuals and persons	12
Liberties and status	17
States or nations	22
Law of nature	26
Visit to Virginia, U.S.	30
American natural oeconomy	35
Linguistic return	38
Text in context	42
Ways to Europes and non-Europes	45
Annexes	50
Sources	50
Readings:	51
Early Euro-American constitutionalism	51
Freedom, discrimination, subjection	52
The severance of textualism	54
For further checks	55
II. Minority making: Indigenous people and non-indigenous law between Mexico and the United States	57
Trompe-l'œil in both history and law: majority as minority	59

Opening challenge: Indigenous citizenship from European Spain to Hispanic Mexico	62
Imperial Constitution and indigenous people	63
Cultural approach and family affairs	65
Indigenous citizenship and colonial rule	67
Constitutional strategies: The location of the individuals	70
Accommodation through powers	72
Municipal incorporation as reservation	74
Territory versus state regime	75
Accommodation through rights	77
Trial by jury and customary law	78
The Mexico-Texas confrontation on rights	80
The Mexican and Texan polities compared	82
Communal property and local government	83
Oaxaca versus Mexico on indigenous self-determination: Ways and means backwards and forwards	86
Constitutional pronouncements and the voice of silence	93
Back to a constituent moment: The law of nations and treaty-making	95
Indigenous Peoples after the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo	101
Awkward constitutional compliance in California	106
The Apache polity and non-sedentary peoples	109
Diné Bikeyá, Navajo Reservation, and the last display of Indian treaties from the United States	111
Pueblo Peoples, Tohono O'odham Nation, and the constitutional limbo within the United States	119
Indigenous rights and the treaties between Mexico and the United States	125
American citizenship and indigenous standing	130
Indian polities and the United States: From constitutional limbo to a so-called self-determination policy	133
Born citizens and native rights	138

The Arizona Territory and Arizonan polity	141
Indian Territory and American State: Oklahoma and New Mexico-Arizona	144
Arizona federated: Union powers over Indian reservations	148
Reservations and state constitutions contrasted	151
Among histories and rights: legal domesticity and constitutional legality	160
Toward a post-colonial world: out of primitive law of nations and far away	167
Beyond minority: current human rights	174
Non-indigenous constitutions and indigenous entitlements	177
Epilogue	184
Index	195