



THE CHIEF JUSTICE EARL WARREN INSTITUTE
ON RACE, ETHNICITY & DIVERSITY

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BERKELEY LAW SCHOOL

BerkeleyLaw
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

The Chief Justice
Earl Warren
Institute on Race,
Ethnicity & Diversity

Bancroft Research Center
2440 Bancroft Way,
Suite 303
Berkeley, CA 94704-7230
Phone: (510) 642-8568
Fax: (510) 643-2362

About the Warren Institute

The Chief Justice Earl Warren Institute on Race, Ethnicity & Diversity is a multidisciplinary, collaborative venture to produce research, research-based policy prescriptions, and curricular innovation on issues of racial and ethnic justice in California and the nation.

AFRICAN AMERICAN–IMMIGRANT TENSIONS: MYTHS, REALITIES AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS¹

Leticia M. Saucedo²

INTRODUCTION

Much has been written about the potential tensions between African Americans and immigrants, especially Latino immigrants. The issue is important because a recurring theme in the debate over immigration reform—one that is shaped by perception as much as by empirical claims—is the effect of immigration on the domestic workforce, our educational system, and on community relations. Low-wage workers have received special attention in this discussion. Policymakers seeking to further restrict immigration frequently cite the need to protect domestic workers from an influx of foreign—and largely low-skilled—competition.

For civil rights advocates and African-American communities, the issue of immigration brings with it concerns about the impact of immigration on African Americans, who are concentrated in the domestic low-wage work force

and are often said to face the greatest competition from modern migrant flows into the United States. Similar concerns arise with respect to the impact of new immigration on established immigrant groups.

The issue of job competition touches skilled professionals as well as low-skilled workers, men as well as women. It is connected to related topics such as the competition for housing, the quality of public education systems, working conditions for low-wage workers, employer discrimination, and relations between immigrant and African-American communities. Studies on relationships between African Americans and Latinos in schools and in communities center on perceived competition in access to resources, as well as competition for opportunities for advancement. The research focuses on these perceptions in an attempt either to

1. Prepared for circulation at **Beyond Conflict or Coalition: The Role of Policy in African American-Immigrant Relations**, Berkeley, CA, June 13, 2008.

2. **Leticia Saucedo** is Associate Professor of Law at William S. Boyd School of Law at University of Nevada, Las Vegas. She is an Affiliated Scholar on Immigration of the Chief Justice Earl Warren Institute on Race, Ethnicity and Diversity at UC Berkeley School of Law. Contact: leticia.saucedo@unlv.edu.

debunk or support the premise that the tensions between these groups are merited.

Although by no means exhaustive this research brief summarizes the areas of research and study of the issues that most affect the relationships between African Americans and immigrants in the workplace, in education, and in communities. The brief is an initial step in determining whether and how the Warren Institute can fill research gaps and move toward formulation of policy recommendations.

BACKGROUND

The Warren Institute Initial Call for Research on the Subject of African American/Immigrant Relationships

In 2006, the Warren Institute issued a call for immigration-related papers in several different thematic areas. One area of continued interest for the Warren Institute is the perceived or real competition between foreign born and domestic workers, including African Americans. The impact of immigration on African American communities affects how these communities perceive their own status within American society, as well as their comparative access to opportunities for advancement. Understanding that perceptions can be guided by more in-depth research and discussion around several issues that affect African American/immigrant relationships,

the Warren Institute identified several key questions for study.

The first set of questions centers on *industry employment patterns and their effects on African American and immigrant hiring practices*:

1. What is the actual impact of undocumented immigration on the African-American workforce, and how is this impact perceived within African-American communities?

2. Are African Americans actually being displaced by new undocumented immigrant workers, or are domestic and immigrant low-wage workers seeking different jobs for cultural or other reasons?

3. How does entrepreneurship among immigrants compare to that of African Americans in terms of the types of businesses being established, access to credit, and access to/use of other community networks and resources?

4. To what extent is the lack of job opportunities for African Americans a product of employer bias?

5. If displacement is in fact occurring and/or if other negative impacts are being felt by African Americans, what potential policy prescriptions could be implemented to address this?

6. What role does gender play in determining the impact of legal and illegal immigration on the domestic workforce? If displacement is in fact occurring, is it affecting male or female workers differently? If so, why?

7. What is the impact of undocumented immigration on workers in second-, third-, etc. generation immigrant communities?

A related set of questions focuses on how immigration—documented or undocumented—affects the *working conditions and opportunities* of native born and workers, including African Americans, and more established immigrant communities:

1. What is the relationship of undocumented immigration low-wage worker supply and the domestic low-wage workforce? How are wages, job opportunities, working conditions, etc. affected by illegal immigration?

2. What is the relationship between the legal immigrant, low-wage worker supply and the domestic low-wage workforce?

3. How are wages, job opportunities, working conditions, etc. affected by immigration status?

4. What are the obstacles to improving wages/working conditions for the domestic low-wage workforce, and how can they be overcome?

5. Are established immigrant communities being displaced by new undocumented immigrant workers?

6. If displacement is occurring and/or if other negative impacts are being felt by established immigrant communities, what potential policy prescriptions could be implemented to address this?

7. How does immigration affect unionization and collective bargaining in this country?

8. What role do/should unions play in preserving/improving labor conditions in the midst of significant immigration?

A third set of questions seeks information about the potential for on *overcoming perceived obstacles to cooperation* between African American communities and immigrants, whether Latino, African or other:

1. What are the areas of conflict and common interest between immigrants and African-American communities?

2. How can the conflicts be overcome and the common interests capitalized on to serve the needs of all groups and bridge the gaps between communities of color?

3. In terms of messaging and rhetoric, how has the immigrants rights movement's use of civil rights language been received by African-American communities?

4. How do African immigrants interact with/impact African-American communities?

5. Is there a difference in the way affirmative action programs impact

African immigrants and African-Americans?

A final set of questions centers around other *effects of immigration on other aspects of the African American community* outside of the workplace context:

1. What is the role of unions in the development of positive relationships between African Americans and immigrants?

2. How do educational levels compare between the two groups, and, if there is a disparity, what are its impacts? What effects, if any, does immigration have on the quality of public education?

3. What impact have immigrant populations had on the availability, cost, and condition of housing for them as well as for the domestic workforce?

EXISTING RESEARCH

This research brief identifies key research available in each of these four areas identified by the Warren Institute as integral to a more nuanced level of debate about the interactions between African Americans and immigrant

communities. These include Industry Employment Patterns; Working Conditions and Opportunities; Overcoming Perceived Obstacles to Cooperation; and Effects of Immigration on Other Aspects of the African American Community. It then proposes a further round of study based on the nuanced narratives arising out of existing research. The rest of this brief will address each subtopic individually, proposing further avenues for research within each.

Effects and Perceived Effects of Industry Employment Patterns

The Warren Institute is interested in creating policy prescriptions that address both the perception and the reality that immigrants and African Americans compete for employment in this country. Much research is already devoted to whether immigrants take jobs from native-born populations, especially African Americans. Although research findings are mixed as to the reality,³ the perception that immigrants take jobs from native born workers, especially low-skilled workers, certainly exists.⁴

3. See e.g., Daniel S. Hamermesh and Frank D. Bean, eds., *HELP OR HINDERANCE? THE ECONOMIC IMPLICATIONS OF IMMIGRATION FOR AFRICAN AMERICANS* (1998); Robert Adelman, Cameron Lippard, Charles Jaret, and Lesley Reid, *Jobs, Poverty and Earnings in American Metropolises: Do Immigrants Really Hurt Economic Outcomes of Blacks?*, 38 *SOCIOLOGICAL FOCUS* 261 (2005) (finding that recent immigration decreases unemployment and increases median pay for middle class Blacks, although it adversely affects lower-skilled Blacks who compete with immigrants for low-skill jobs); Steven Raphael and Lucas Ronconi, *The Effects of Labor Market Competition with Immigrants on the Wages and Employment and Natives: What Does Existing Research Tell Us?* 23 UC

Berkeley Ctr. on Wage and Employment Dynamics Research Paper (2007), available at http://iir.berkeley.edu/cwed/ronconi/immigration_existing_research.pdf.

4. See e.g., Pew Research Center for the People & the Press, *Pew Hispanic Center, America's Immigration Quandary*, 39 (2006). The Pew poll revealed that over a third of African Americans polled believe that immigrants take jobs from U.S. citizens (as opposed to "jobs Americans don't want"), compared to a quarter of white respondents. Carroll Doherty, *Attitudes Toward Immigration: In Black and White*, Pew Research Center Publications, Apr. 26, 2006.

“Much more research is needed... to recommend policies that undo the perception that workers compete with each other in a vacuum and without regard to employer or government policies.”

Studies have been conducted on a general level,⁵ as well as on a local level,⁶ on a regional level,⁷ within occupations,⁸ and longitudinally.⁹ Many of the studies focus on determining whether immigrants compete with native born workers for jobs, or decrease wages in those occupations. For the most part, the findings and results report mixed outcomes. Studies have found that immigration harms less educated native-born workers, black and Latino, although just how much remains unclear.¹⁰

Some studies have found that large numbers of recently arrived immigrants in a particular occupation, have a negative effect on native born workers' wages, whether less recently arrived immigrants, native born workers of the same ethnicity, or African Americans.¹¹ Other studies have found that mid-level Blacks in expanding economies are not affected negatively by immigration.¹² Still others have found that niche employment helps immigrants more than it helps African Americans.¹³

Few studies concentrate on government or employer policies and practices that create the perception—or reality—that immigrants are filling jobs that native born workers would otherwise occupy. Much more research is needed to address the practices that foster tensions in this area, and to recommend policies that undo the perception that workers compete with each other in a vacuum and without regard to employer or government policies. Moreover, the gender effects of both practices that create tensions and possible solutions should be theorized.

Working Conditions & Opportunities

The Warren Institute's inquiry in this area is centered on the relationship between labor market supply and demand, and the effects of undocumented immigration on job prospects and opportunities for

5. Frank Bean and Stephanie Bell-Rose, eds., *IMMIGRATION AND OPPORTUNITY: RACE, ETHNICITY AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE UNITED STATES* (1999); Hamermesh and Bean, *supra* note 3.

6. See e.g., Roger Waldinger, *STILL THE PROMISED CITY? AFRICAN AMERICANS AND NEW IMMIGRANTS IN POSTINDUSTRIAL NEW YORK* 155–170 (1996); Cynthia Cranford, *Networks of Exploitation: Immigrant Labor and the Restructuring of the Los Angeles Janitorial Industry*, 52 *SOCIAL PROBLEMS* 379, 386 (2005); Roger Waldinger and Michael Lichter, *HOW THE OTHER HALF WORKS: IMMIGRATION AND THE SOCIAL ORGANIZATION OF LABOR* (2003) (analyzing the effects of employer preferences on the hiring of immigrants and blacks in Los Angeles); Philip Moss and Chris Tilly, *STORIES EMPLOYERS TELL: RACE, SKILL AND HIRING IN AMERICA* (2001).

7. See e.g., Barbara Ellen Smith, *Across Races and Nations: Social Justice Organizing in the Transnational South*, in *LATINOS IN THE NEW SOUTH* 254 (Smith and Furuseth, eds., 2006); Frank D. Bean, Jennifer Van Hook, and Mark Fossett, *Immigration, Spatial and Economic Change, and African American Employment*, in *IMMIGRATION AND OPPORTUNITY: RACE, ETHNICITY, AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE UNITED STATES* 31 (Frank D. Bean & Stephanie Bell-Rose eds., 1999)

8. See e.g., Lisa Catanzarite, *Occupational Context and Wage Competition of New Immigrant Latinos with Minorities and Whites*, in *THE IMPACT OF IMMIGRATION ON AFRICAN AMERICANS* 59, 68–69 (Steven Shulman ed., 2004); Lisa Catanzarite, *Dynamics of Earnings and Segregation in Brown-Collar Occu-*

pations, 29 *WORK & OCCUPATIONS* 300 (2002) (finding that as occupations become more brown-collar, median pay depreciated for all employees, suggesting that increases in newcomer immigrants adverse affect the pay of native-born workers).

9. Catanzarite (2002) *supra* note 8.

10. See e.g., Howard F. Chang, *The Economic Impact of Labor Migration: Recent Estimates and Policy Implications*, 16 *TEMP. POL. & CIV. RTS. L. REV.* 321 (2007) (surveying the economic literature and finding a small adverse impact of immigration on native-born wages for low-skilled workers); Hannes Johannsson and Steven Shulman, *Immigration and the Employment of African American Workers*, *THE REVIEW OF BLACK POLITICAL ECONOMY* 95 (2003) (finding that a sustained, large scale immigration has negative effects on the wages and earnings of workers who most directly compete with immigrants for jobs, ultimately forcing workers to withdraw from the labor force); and *id.*

11. Catanzarite, *supra* note 9, at 68–69.

12. See e.g., Adelman, et al., *supra* note 3.

13. See e.g., Waldinger and Lichter, *supra* note 6; Robert Cherry, *Immigration and Race: What We Think We Know*, *THE REVIEW OF BLACK POLITICAL ECONOMY*, 165–166 (2003) (reviewing several studies that determine that immigration has an overall negative effect on employment and educational prospects for African Americans).

native born workers, especially in the low-wage sector. To the extent that perceptions of job competition exist between African Americans and Latino immigrants, scholars have explored the restructuring of the economy, employer preferences,¹⁴ the weakening of unions,¹⁵ and racial bias¹⁶ as possible reasons. Roger Waldinger and Michael Lichter, for example, interviewed hundreds of employers in the Los Angeles area, seeking to understand their motivations for seeking immigrant over native-born workers. They concluded that employers perceived immigrant workers as more subservient and compliant than their native-born counterparts, and therefore more suited to the low-wage, difficult jobs employers offer.¹⁷ While seeking the most subservient workers is not *prima facie* discriminatory,

One recurring theme surrounding perceived tensions between African Americans and immigrants is the growth in contingent, flexible or independent contractor labor, which increasingly replaces long-term steady employment as the employment of choice for many low-wage employers.

sociologist Stephen Steinberg notes such seemingly neutral practices are, in effect, discriminatory.¹⁸

One recurring theme surrounding perceived tensions between African Americans and immigrants is the growth in contingent, flexible or independent contractor labor, which increasingly replaces long-term steady employment as the employment of choice for many low-wage employers. Social science research indicates that employer trends toward such

labor arrangements correlate with increases in Latino immigrant employment and the use of temporary agencies.¹⁹ At the same time, the structure of the work precludes opportunities for African Americans, especially as the jobs are stripped of their benefits, security, predictability and long-term employment potential.²⁰ At the same time that employers are reducing their costs of labor, they are externalizing those costs to individuals and communities. These dynamics, in turn, contribute to the

14. See e.g., Waldinger and Lichter, *supra* note 6; Moss and Tilly, *supra* note 6; Nelson Lim, *On the Backs of Blacks? Immigrants and the Fortunes of African Americans*, in STRANGERS AT THE GATES: NEW IMMIGRANTS IN URBAN AMERICA (Roger Waldinger, ed. 2001); Joleen Kirschenman and Kathryn Neckerman, 'We'd Love to Hire Them But...': *The Meaning of Race for Employers*, in THE URBAN UNDERCLASS (C. Jencks and P. Peterson, eds., 1991).

15. Ruth Milkman, L.A. STORY: IMMIGRANT WORKERS AND THE FUTURE OF THE U.S. LABOR MOVEMENT (2006).

16. Stephen Steinberg, *Immigration, African Americans, and Race Discourse*, in RACE AND LABOR MATTERS IN THE NEW U.S. ECONOMY 181-182 (Manning Marable, Immanuel Ness, and Joseph Wilson, eds., 2006).

17. See Waldinger and Lichter, *supra* note 6, at 144.

18. Steinberg, *supra* note 16.

19. See e.g., David H. Ciscel, Barbara Ellen Smith, and Marcela Mendoza, *Ghosts in the Global Machine: New Immigrants and the Redefinition of Work*, 37 JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC ISSUES 333 (June 2003).

20. *Id.* at 339.

tensions within communities of African Americans and immigrants, as these same communities try to address how to cover these externalized costs.²¹

The policy considerations and the potentially discriminatory practices underlying employer decisions to hire immigrants over native born workers, as well as the job structures—such as independent contracting—that seem to diminish opportunities for fair employment and living wages, all must be explored further. These policies and practices directly affect employment opportunities for both native born and immigrant workers. If allowed to proliferate unchecked, tensions between African American and immigrant communities will continue to escalate. In sum, if these studies are correct that some level of displacement or negative impact is felt by African American communities, further re-search identifying potential policy prescriptions is necessary.

We need research that can help identify policy prescriptions for regulating practices that encourage employers to favor immigrants over African American workers, as well as those that create job structures that keep both African Americans and immigrants out of fair, living wage jobs.

Overcoming Perceived Obstacles to Cooperation

The Warren Institute seeks a deeper understanding of the issues and the organizing practices that can potentially unite immigrants and African Americans. One line of research explores the perceived obstacles to and opportunities for coalition building between African Americans and immigrants from ethnographic, empirical,²² and historical perspectives.²³ Barbara Ellen Smith, for example, has studied relationships between Latino immigrants and African Americans in the South, exploring issues such as the potential for cross-racial organizing, and whether the

term “civil rights” can encompass the needs of both communities.²⁴ Smith suggests that organizers avoid identifying either African Americans or immigrants as simply workers or people of color in their attempts to find alliances between the African American and immigrant communities because such alliances ignore both the history of the African American struggle for civil rights and the increasing nativism that puts immigrants in danger.²⁵

One of the recurring themes in this research is the extent to which African Americans perceive that new immigrants are simply the latest among a long line of immigrants who have surpassed African Americans in terms of prosperity as they move toward whiteness.²⁶ To the extent that this perception is widespread, it hinders long-term organizing around issues common to immigrants and African Americans.²⁷ Some research shows that, in fact, some subgroups of Asians and Latino immigrants are not prospering at the level of previous generations of their cohorts,

21. *Id.* at 339–340.

22. See e.g., Albert Camarillo, *Black and Brown in Compton: Demographic Change, Suburban Decline, and Intergroup Relations in a South Central Los Angeles Community, 1950 to 2000*, in NOT JUST BLACK AND WHITE 358 (Nancy Foner and M. Fredrickson, eds. 2004).

23. See e.g., Nancy Foner, *Immigration, Race and Ethnicity in the United States: Social Constructions and Social Relations in Historical and Contemporary Perspective*, in NOT JUST BLACK AND WHITE 1 (Nancy Foner and M. Fredrickson, eds. 2004) (tracing historical relationships between Blacks and emerging immigrant populations in the United States).

24. See Smith, *supra* note 7.

25. *Id.*

26. See e.g., Manuel Pastor and Enrico Marcelli, *Somewhere Over the Rainbow: African Americans, Unauthorized Mexican Immigration, and Coalition Building*, THE REVIEW OF BLACK POLITICAL ECONOMY 125 (2003); Frank Bean and Jennifer Lee, *Reinventing the Color Line: Immigration and America's New Racial/Ethnic Divide*, 86 SOCIAL FORCES 561 (2007) (exploring the emergence of a black-nonblack divide that separates blacks from other groups, including immigrants. However, a black-nonblack divide could reemerge if the definition of white is expanded to include growing numbers of immigrants); and Steinberg, *supra* note 16, at 180.

27. This perception was explored at a strategy meeting hosted by the Center for New Community, in which African American leaders confronted some of the perceptions about immigration, globalization, and demographic trends. See Center for New Community: Which Way Forward, National Strategic Meeting Notes, August 16–17, 2007.

indicating that there is a class dimension to the narrative of prosperity that cannot be ignored.²⁸ The more immigrants have faced discrimination and poverty, the more they will feel a distance between themselves and Whites, and a corresponding affinity with Blacks.²⁹ On the other hand, some research shows that Latino immigrants tend to identify less with Blacks than they do with Whites, and that they hold negative attitudes toward Blacks.³⁰ These same studies note that increases in education, more interaction with Blacks and a sense of linked fate with other Latinos, all reduce Latino immigrants' negative attitudes.³¹ Studies have also shown that increased political participation among Latinos, and a shared sense of minority status, differential treatment, and disempowerment create avenues for coalition building between communities.³² The more politically aware Latino communities become, the more likely they are and other minorities. Further research is to form political alliances with Blacks necessary to determine whether this find-

ing holds for more recently arrived immigrants.

On the other hand, several successful attempts to organize workers across racial and ethnic lines have been documented. Organizing efforts in Mississippi, Louisiana, California, and Tennessee demonstrate the possibility of uniting across racial lines to oppose oppressive and discriminatory working conditions.³³ In Mississippi, for example, the Mississippi Immigrants Rights Alliance and the Mississippi Workers' Center have allied to help both Black and immigrant workers to enforce labor rights in the service and food processing industries.³⁴ In the Midwest, a coalition of African American faith-based organizations has begun to organize and provide materials to African American communities about the white nationalist origins of many anti-immigrant initiatives. The coalition's mission is to provide support for African Americans who want to work toward a more humane immigration policy.³⁵

The Warren Institute seeks to encourage the best practices that bring African Americans and immigrants together. At the same time, we seek to encourage the reflective critique and analysis of current movements within the immigrant and African American communities, as well as cross-racial experiences that may provide insight for future alliances, especially in areas where immigrants are changing the demographics of communities. To that end, we seek research that offers examples of successful organizing attempts, as well as critical work that tests the strength of coalition and organizational work on issues of import to African American and immigrant communities.

Effects of Immigration on Other Aspects of the African American Community

The Warren Institute is interested in the effects of current immigration patterns on African American communities at home and in public schools. Current research focusing

28. Gerald Jaynes, *Immigration and the American Dream*, in IMMIGRATION AND RACE 18–23 (Gerald Jaynes, ed., 2000).

29. *Id.*, at 18–19.

30. Paula D. McClain, et al., *Racial Distancing in a Southern City: Latino Immigrants' Views of Black Americans*, 68 JOURNAL OF POLITICS 571, 579 (2006); Mindiola, et al, BLACK-BROWN RELATIONSHIPS AND STEREOTYPES (2002) (studying Latino immigrant and Black interactions in Houston, where native born Latinos have a large presence).

31. McClain, et al., *supra* note 30, at 581.

32. John Garcia, *Coalition Formation: The Mexican-Origin Community and Latinos and African Americans*, in IMMIGRATION AND RACE 274 (Gerald Jaynes, ed. 2000) (reviewing 1980's and 1990's data on political participation and attitudes of Latino community participants).

33. See Jennifer Gordon and R.A. Lenhardt, *Conflict and Solidarity Between African American and Latino Immigrant Workers*, Warren Institute Working Paper on Immigration (November 2007), available at <http://www.law.berkeley.edu/centers/ewi/Gordon&LenhardtpaperNov30.pdf>. (describing successful cross-racial organizing efforts in urban and rural settings in the South).

34. David Bacon, *Black and Brown Together*, THE AMERICAN PROSPECT, March 2008, available at http://www.prospect.org/cs/articles?article=black_and_brown_together.

35. Center for New Community, *Which Way Forward?: African Americans, Immigration and Race*, Summary Report (May 2007).

on residential patterns and their effects on intergroup relationships shows that African Americans and immigrants are increasingly living as neighbors, and that immigrants are moving into neighborhoods that were historically segregated and Black.³⁶ Although results are mixed, some research suggests that, among multiethnic groups, the degree of negative racial stereotyping by one group of another rises with a group's racial isolation at the neighborhood level.³⁷ This research, focusing on neighborhood level residential patterns demonstrates that "those who live amongst more out-groups have more positive attitudes toward those groups; those who live amongst more of their own racial group hold more negative views of out-groups and perceive more competitions from out-groups."³⁸ Such research indicates that residential proximity and social interaction at the neighborhood level can reduce intergroup antagonism. This research also shows that, with respect to immigrants, "the greater the percentage of in-group members within the neighborhood, the greater the sense

of zero-sum competition with minority out-groups and the greater the perception of threats from immigration."³⁹ This research is in line with recent Warren Institute-supported scholarship showing that among those local governments in Pennsylvania considering anti-immigrant ordinances, the biggest factors determining the passage of an ordinance were political rather than demographic; passage of a local ordinance was highly correlated to the proportion of Republicans residing in a particular area.⁴⁰ On the other hand, research also indicates that relative economic status affects black attitudes toward Latinos. Blacks are more likely to have negative stereotypes of Latinos in geographic areas where Latinos are perceived to have an economic advantage.⁴¹ They are more likely to view Black and Latino political and economic interests as incompatible in those neighborhoods.⁴² Still other research suggests that despite possible negative effects of labor competition, African Americans have been more sympathetic towards immigrants than

their White counterparts.⁴³ Data suggest that African Americans in Los Angeles, for example, are more tolerant of their immigrant neighbors than Whites, and are more optimistic about political alliances.⁴⁴ One particular case study analyzing demographic residential trends in Compton, suggests that while tensions exist between Black and Latino immigrant communities, cooperation and community building within neighborhoods also exist.⁴⁵

This line of research has important policy implications for local and state governments and policy makers trying to deal with intergroup tensions such as group violence in cities like Los Angeles, or with calls from local residents for restrictive immigration policies. A recent study found that, in the absence of guidance from local governments, police departments navigated relationships with immigrant communities within their jurisdictions in correlation with their adherence to community service principles.⁴⁶ The more that police departments were run on professionalism and

36. Philip Ethington, William Frey, and Dowell Myers, *The Racial Resegregation of Los Angeles County*, University of Southern California Race Contours Project 8–9 (2001); Pastor and Marcelli, *supra* note 26.

37. Eric Oliver and Janelle Wong, *Inter-group Prejudice in Multiethnic Settings*, 47 AMERICAN JOURNAL OF POLITICAL SCIENCE 567 (2003).

38. *Id.* at 568.; *see also*, Camarillo, *supra* note 22, at 361–362. (describing the effects of demographic changes over several decades in the eastern Los Angeles suburbs that led to segregated Latino neighborhoods that were once Black and White).

39. Oliver and Wong, *supra* note 37, at 576.

40. S. Karthick Ramakrishnan and Tom Wong, *Immigration Policies Go Local: The Varying Responses of Local Governments to Undocumented Immigrants*,

Report for the Warren Institute (November 2007), *available at* <http://www.law.berkeley.edu/centers/ewi/Ramakrishnan&Wongpaperfinal.pdf>.

41. Claudine Gay, *Seeing Difference: The Effect of Economic Disparity on Black Attitudes Toward Latinos*, 50 AMERICAN JOURNAL OF POLITICAL SCIENCE 982 (2006).

42. *Id.*, at 991.

43. Pastor and Marcelli, *supra* note 26, at 138.

44. *Id.*, at 145.

45. Camarillo, *supra* note 22, at 368.

46. Paul G. Lewis and Karthick Ramakrishnan, *Police Practice in Immigrant-Destination Cities: Political Control or Bureaucratic Professionalism?* 42 URBAN AFFAIRS REVIEW 874 (2007).

service models, the more they cultivated positive relationships with immigrant communities.⁴⁷ The study concluded that police departments in immigrant destination cities seem to be supportive and engaging of immigrant communities' needs, more so than elected officials, indicating that police departments are more immune from political pressure than their elected counterparts.⁴⁸ More research in this area is needed to determine whether the pattern continues in more multi-racial environments.

With respect to education, although there are countless studies documenting the race gap in education and the effects of tracking on dropout rates among Blacks and Latinos, few studies focus on the relationships between Blacks and Latinos and the effect of those relationships on how each group perceives their educational opportunities. In one such study, Robert Fairlie found that the number of Latino students leaving the public school system increases with the percentage of Blacks in the public school system.⁴⁹ Fairlie

concludes that further research is needed to determine whether the trend among both Latinos and Whites signals a growing trend toward the resegregation of schools. For example, it is unclear from the research whether the trend correlates with the quality of the public schools and whether that effect is what is being captured.⁵⁰

With respect to whether immigrants negatively affect African American educational prospects, the research is also mixed. One study of California schools indicated that increased immigration hinders African American high school completion.⁵¹ The author of the study argues that immigrants compete with others for school resources by increasing the marginal cost of education to native minorities. Another study notes that federal Chapter 1 educational services are sometimes used to supplement bilingual education in school districts with increasing numbers of English language learners.⁵² Both studies suggest that, while the differences are marginal, the effects for native

born children are potentially negative if educational resources continue to diminish.

More research is needed on the effects of intergroup contact at the neighborhood and local levels, and in schools. Such research should identify specific policies that can influence greater cooperation and reduce stereotypes that create distance between African Americans and immigrants.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS: RESTRUCTURING THE CURRENT PARADIGMS

A small group of legal scholars, including Devon Carbado, and Jennifer Gordon and Robin Lenhardt have been exploring in their writings a redefinition of the problems facing African Americans and Latino immigrants. Their scholarship focuses on recasting the perceived tensions as byproducts of public policies, legal regulation and private practices that merge to create division among multi-racial constituencies. Carbado, for example, notes that Blacks have historically been cast in a racial-

47. *Id.*, at 897.

48. *Id.*

49. Robert W. Fairlie, *Private Schools and "Latino Flight" from Black Schoolchildren*, 39 *DEMOGRAPHY* 655 (2002).

50. *Id.*, at 671.

51. Julian Betts, *Educational Crowding Out: Do Immigrants Affect the Educational Attainment of American Minorities?* in *HELP OR HINDRANCE? THE ECONOMIC IMPLICATIONS OF IMMIGRATION FOR AFRICAN AMERICANS* 253 (Hamermesh and Bean, eds. 1998).

52. Michael Fix and Wendy Zimmerman, *Educating Immigrant Children: Chapter 1 in Changing Cities*, in *IMMIGRATION AND RACE: NEW CHALLENGES FOR AMERICAN DEMOCRACY* (Gerald Jaynes, ed., 2000).

ized outsider role, even as they become socialized as Americans, whether or not they are citizens.⁵³ Likewise, immigrants have a role as non-blacks, whether or not they themselves become citizens.⁵⁴ Citizenship and becoming American, therefore, are separate processes by which newcomers are incorporated into the culture.⁵⁵ Taking Carbadó's citizenship and Americanization theories, Gordon and Lenhardt suggest a theory of "belonging" in a community that describes relations between African Americans and Latino immigrants—and their distinct relationships to work—in a more nuanced way.⁵⁶ They examine the relationship between work and belonging for each group, and how each group navigates access as part of the process of belonging in a community. Their theory itself should be considered a starting point in thinking about how public policies—not just immigration and employment, but immigration and education, housing and political participation—can be linked to provide more comprehensive solutions that avoid recycling tensions between African Americans and immigrant communities. In a similar vein, sociologist Stephen

Steinberg challenges policymakers and others to confront the role that immigration and labor policies have played in developing a permanent class of flexible, exploitable labor, both at the lower and the middle class levels.⁵⁷ He also challenges social scientists studying the tensions between these communities to more fully explore the racial implications of employer practices such as preferences, and of government action, such as laissez faire labor and employment discrimination policies.⁵⁸ The theories of such scholars require support and further inquiry, with a goal of producing tangible policy proposals for public and private actors.

CONCLUSION

Further lines of inquiry must address the role of policymakers such as governments, school districts, employers and legislators in exacerbating or reducing tensions between immigrant and African American communities. The Warren Institute is committed to seeking out and sponsoring research that explores the public policy dynamics behind both the tensions and any attempts to resolve perceived conflicts. The Warren Institute is also

committed to enhancing the dialogue by supporting cutting edge research on the role of policymakers, and by supporting efforts to change practices that continue to foster tensions.

To that end, the Warren Institute seeks more refined research, as discussed above, on policies that affect relationships in the workplace, in schools and in neighborhoods. Ultimately, this type of research can and should inform broader immigration, labor, education and local government laws and policies. For example, what would an immigration policy look like that considered both the needs of African Americans and the responsibilities of government to manage humane and realistic migration patterns to the United States? We seek innovative or best practices research, along with research that supports recommendations for government or private actor policy changes. The Warren Institute is committed, not just to sponsoring such research but to making it available and accessible to policymakers, legislators, and advocates who are confronted with the realities or perceptions of multiracial tensions within their communities.

53. Devon Carbadó, *Racial Naturalization*, 57 AMERICAN QUARTERLY 633 (2005).

54. *Id.* at 633.

55. *Id.* at 642.

56. Jennifer Gordon and R.A. Lenhardt, *Rethinking Work and Citizenship*, 55 UCLA L. REV. (forthcoming 2008); see also, Gordon and Lenhardt, *supra* note 33.

57. Steinberg, *supra* note 16.

58. *Id.*, at 189–190.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

On Effects and Perceived Effects of Industry Employment Patterns

- Adelman, Robert, Cameron Lip-pard, Charles Jaret, and Lesley Reid. *Jobs, Poverty and Earnings in American Metropolises: Do Immigrants Really Hurt Economic Outcomes of Blacks?*, 38 *SOCIOLOGICAL FOCUS* 261 (2005).
- Bean, Frank D., Jennifer Van Hook, and Mark Fossett. *Immigration, Spatial and Economic Change, and African American Employment*, in *IMMIGRATION AND OPPORTUNITY: RACE, ETHNICITY, AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE UNITED STATES* 31 (Frank D. Bean & Stephanie Bell-Rose eds., 1999).
- Catanzarite, Lisa. *Dynamics of Earnings and Segregation in Brown-Collar Occupations*, 29 *WORK & OCCUPATIONS* 300 (2002).
- Catanzarite, Lisa. *Occupational Context and Wage Competition of New Immigrant Latinos with Minorities and Whites*, in *THE IMPACT OF IMMIGRATION ON AFRICAN AMERICANS* 59 (Steven Shulman, ed., 2004).
- Chang, Howard F. *The Economic Impact of Labor Migration: Recent Estimates and Policy Implications*, 16 *Temp. Pol. & Civ. Rts. L. Rev.* (forthcoming), available at <http://lsr.nellco.org/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1136&context=upenn/wps>.
- Ciscel, David H., Barbara Ellen Smith, and Marcela Mendoza. *Ghosts in the Global Machine: New Immigrants and the Redefinition of Work*, 37 *JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC ISSUES* 333 (June 2003).
- Cranford, Cynthia. *Networks of Exploitation: Immigrant Labor and the Restructuring of the Los Angeles Janitorial Industry*, 52 *SOCIAL PROBLEMS* 379 (2005).
- Doherty, Carroll. *Attitudes Toward Immigration: In Black and White*, PEW RESEARCH CENTER PUBLICATIONS, Apr. 26, 2006.
- LeDuff, Charlie. *At A Slaughterhouse, Some Things Never Die: Who Kills, Who Cuts, Who Bosses Can Depend on Race*, *NEW YORK TIMES* A1, June 16, 2000.
- Pew Research Center for the People & the Press and Pew Hispanic Center. *AMERICA'S IMMIGRATION QUANDARY* (2006).
- Raphael, Steven, and Lucas Ronconi. *The Effects of Labor Market Competition with Immigrants on the Wages and Employment of Natives: What Does Existing Research Tell Us?* UC Berkeley Ctr. on Wage and Employment Dynamics Research Paper (2007), available at http://iir.berkeley.edu/cwed/ronconi/immigration_existing_research.pdf.
- Waldinger, Roger. *STILL THE PROMISED CITY? AFRICAN AMERICANS AND NEW IMMIGRANTS IN POST-INDUSTRIAL NEW YORK* (1996).
- Waldinger, Roger, and Michael Lichter. *HOW THE OTHER HALF WORKS: IMMIGRATION AND THE SOCIAL ORGANIZATION OF LABOR* (2003).
- [On Working Conditions and Opportunities](#)
- Martínez, Elizabeth. *Black and Brown Workers Alliance Born in North Carolina: Five Organizers Speak*, *Z MAGAZINE*, October 2000.
- Smith, Barbara Ellen. *Across Races and Nations: Social Justice Organizing in the Transnational South*, in *LATINOS IN THE NEW SOUTH* (Heather Smith and Owen Furuseth, eds., 2006).
- Smith, Barbara Ellen. *Job Competition and Tensions in the Workplace*, in *ACROSS RACES & NATIONS: BUILDING NEW COMMUNITIES IN THE U.S. SOUTH* 77 (Center for Research on Women, University of Memphis, 2006).
- Steinberg, Stephen. *Immigration, African Americans, and Race Discourse*, in *RACE AND LABOR MATTERS IN THE NEW U.S. ECONOMY* 175 (Manning Marable, Immanuel Ness, and Joseph Wilson, eds., 2006).
- [On Overcoming Perceived Obstacles to Cooperation](#)
- Bean, Frank, and Jennifer Lee. *Reinventing the Color Line: Immigration and America's New Racial/Ethnic Divide*, 86 *SOCIAL FORCES* 561 (2007).
- Betancur, John J. *Framing the Discussion of African American-Latino Relations: A Review and Analysis*, in *NEITHER ENEMIES NOR FRIENDS: LATINOS, BLACKS, AFROLATINOS* 159 (Anani Dzidzienyo and Suzanne Oboler, eds., 2005).
- Ethington, Philip, William Frey, and Dowell Myers. *The Racial Resegregation of Los Angeles County*, University of Southern California Race Contours Project (2001).
- McClain, Paula, et al. *Racial Distancing in a Southern City: Latino Immigrants' Views of Black Americans*, 86 *JOURNAL OF POLITICS* 571 (2006).

Mindiola, Tatcho, Yolanda Flores Niemann, and Néstor Rodríguez. BLACK-BROWN RELATIONS AND STEREOTYPES (2002).

Pastor, Manuel, and Enrico Marcelli. *Somewhere Over the Rainbow: African Americans, Unauthorized Mexican Immigration, and Coalition Building*, THE REVIEW OF BLACK POLITICAL ECONOMY 125 (2003).

Smith, Barbara Ellen. *Across Races and Nations: Social Justice Organizing in the Transnational South*, in LATINOS IN THE NEW SOUTH (Heather Smith and Owen Furueth, eds., 2006).

Smith, Barbara Ellen. *Racial/Ethnic Rivalry and Solidarity in the Delta*, in ACROSS RACES AND NATIONS: BUILDING NEW COMMUNITIES IN THE U.S. SOUTH 51 (Center for Research on Women, 2006).

Steinberg, Stephen. *Immigration, African Americans, and Race Discourse*, in RACE AND LABOR MATTERS IN THE NEW U.S. ECONOMY 175 (Manning Marable, Immanuel Ness, and Joseph Wilson, eds., 2006).

On Effects of Immigration on Other Aspects of the African American Community

Betts, Julian. *Educational Crowding Out: Do Immigrants Affect the Educational Attainment of American Minorities?*, in HELP OR HINDRANCE? THE ECONOMIC IMPLICATIONS OF IMMIGRATION FOR AFRICAN AMERICANS 253 (Hamermesh and Bean, eds., 1998).

Camarillo, Albert M. *Black and Brown in Compton: Demographic Change, Suburban Decline, and Inter-*

group Relations in a South Central Los Angeles Community, 1950 to 2000, in NOT JUST BLACK AND WHITE 358 (Nancy Foner and M. Fredrickson, eds. 2004).

Fairlie, Robert W. *Private Schools and "Latino Flight" from Black Schoolchildren*, 39 DEMOGRAPHY 655 (Nov. 2002).

Fix, Michael, and Wendy Zimmerman. *Educating Immigrant Children: Chapter 1 in Changing Cities*, in IMMIGRATION AND RACE: NEW CHALLENGES FOR AMERICAN DEMOCRACY (Gerald Jaynes, ed., 2000).

Oliver, Eric, and Janelle Wong. *Inter-group Prejudice in Multiethnic Settings*, 47 AMERICAN JOURNAL OF POLITICAL SCIENCE 567 (2003).

Sampson, Robert J., and Stephen W. Raudenbush. *Neighborhood Stigma and the Perception of Disorder*, 24 FOCUS 319 (2005).

Additional Related Readings

Foerster, Amy. *Race, Identity, and Belonging: 'Blackness' and the Struggle for Solidarity in a Multiethnic Labor Union*, 51 SOCIAL PROBLEMS (August 2004).

Foner, Nancy. *Immigration, Race and Ethnicity in the United States: Social Constructions and Social Relations in Historical and Contemporary Perspective*, in NOT JUST BLACK AND WHITE 1 (Nancy Foner and M. Fredrickson, eds. 2004).

Garcia, John. *Coalition Formation: The Mexican-Origin Community and Latinos and African Americans*, in IMMIGRATION AND RACE 274 (Gerald Jaynes, ed. 2000).

Johnson, Kevin R. *African American*

and Latina/o Cooperation in Challenging Racial Profiling, in NEITHER ENEMIES NOR FRIENDS: LATINOS, BLACKS, AFRO-LATINOS (Anani Dzidzienyo and Suzanne Oboler, eds., 2005).

Johnson, Kevin R. *The Struggle for Civil Rights: The Need for, and Impediments to, Political Coalitions Among and Within Minority Groups*, 63 LOUISIANA LAW REVIEW 2003).

Martínez, Elizabeth. *An Open Letter to Black Americans from Latinos* (dated September 9, 2003), available on www.FinalCall.com.

Odem, Mary, and Elaine Lacy, eds. *HEADING NORTH TO THE SOUTH: MEXICAN IMMIGRANTS IN TODAY'S SOUTH*, forthcoming in 2008, University of Georgia Press.

Pitts, Steven. *The Race Question and Building Labor Power in the Context of the Immigrant Upsurge*, Labor and Working Class History Association Newsletter, Fall 2007.

Vásquez, Aurora. "Mendez v. Westminster: The Latino Link to Brown v. Board," 26 (3) CORNERSTONE (Newsletter of the National Legal Aid and Defender Association), (Fall 2004).

Vaughn, Bobby. *The African Diaspora Through Ojos Mexicanos: Blackness and Mexicanidad in Southern Mexico*, 33 THE REVIEW OF BLACK POLITICAL ECONOMY (Summer 2005).

Warren, Jonathan W., and France Winddance Twine. *White Americans, the New Minority?: Non-Blacks and the Ever-Expanding Boundaries of Whiteness*, 28 JOURNAL OF BLACK STUDIES 200 (1997).