The Orphans, the Market, and the Dogma

Ariel Katz

Associate Professor
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Orphan Works Symposium, Berkeley, April 2012
Permission first
**dogma**  In general, a belief held unquestioningly and with undefended certainty. In the Christian Church, a belief communicated by divine revelation, and defined by the Church.

Dogmatism is one possible reaction to scepticism: it selects some set of propositions and insists, apparently arbitrarily, that they be not doubted.

“[T]he law of the United States is that a copyright owner may sit back, do nothing and enjoy his property rights untrammeled by others exploiting his works without permission.”

Judge Chin, Authors Guild v. Google, citing David Nimmer
... sit back, do nothing.
Oy Canada!
Members: known & paid

Non-members: unknown & unpaid

Extended Copyright Collective
Copyright Board of Canada

- No free insurance for violators;
- Disgorgement of profit (the user is an offender);
- Payment should be the norm;
- “given the choice, the unlocatable copyright owner would prefer that the royalties be paid to a group that represents interests similar to those of the owner than to see the user take advantage of the owner's copyright for free.”
Printed indulgence certificate signed by Johannes Tietzel (Tetzel) (circa 1517).

The German text reads, "In the authority of all the saints, and in compassion towards you, I absolve you from all sins and misdeeds, and remit all punishment for ten days."
Is there a better solution?
Common law solution: Remedy Tweaking
Remedy tweaking

• In deciding the appropriate remedy
• After a finding of infringement (when not fair use, etc)
• Locatability of the owner should be a relevant consideration
Public benefits/costs ≠ private benefits/costs
Owner considers only private costs and benefits

- Not orphan: when expected $V_{\text{private}} > C_{\text{info}}$
- Orphan: when expected $V_{\text{private}} > C_{\text{info}}$
- Public costs and benefits externalized (ignored)
© owner is
Least-cost avoider
Incentives

| if you don’t make yourself easily locatable **ex ante** you will be entitled to less **ex post** |
| invest today and be entitled to all remedies in the future | OR | don’t invest today but you might earn less in the future |

Petr Kratochvil, *Wooden Sticks in Sephia Tone Background*
Unknown, *Carrots*
Duty to mitigate
How to solve the orphans problem?

- Encourage ownership records
- Incentives to cost avoiders to avoid cost
- Decline the “New Stationers’” invitation
- Don’t substitute an “indulgences industry” for copyright markets