

# **When Copyright Law and Science Collide: Empowering Digitally Integrated Research Methods on a Global Scale**

**Jerome H. Reichman and Ruth L. Okediji**

***Forthcoming  
University of Minnesota Law Review  
May 2012***

# Table of Contents

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1357</b>
<b>A. Potentially Boundless Scientific Opportunities in the Digital Environment</b>	<b>1358</b>
<b>B. Copyright and Related Laws as Digital Gridlock</b>	<b>1360</b>
<b>C. Nature and Scope of This Article</b>	<b>1361</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>I. The Growing Divide Between Copyright Law and Scientific Research in Historical Perspective</b>	<b>1362</b>
<b>A. Two Conceptual Approaches in the Application of Copyright Law to Science</b>	<b>1364</b>
<b>1. Harmonizing the Designated Limitations and Exceptions that Defend Scientific Research in the European Union</b>	<b>1365</b>
<b>2. The Fair Use Approach in the United States</b>	<b>1369</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>B. New Boundaries Imposed by International Law</b>	<b>1372</b>
<b>1. Normative Blindness at the World Trade Organization (WTO)</b>	<b>1373</b>
<b>2. Potential Flexibility Under the WIPO Copyright Treaty (WCT)</b>	<b>1375</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>C. The Shrinking Realm of Scientific Users' Rights Under Either Approach</b>	<b>1377</b>
<b>1. Impeding Scientific Research Even in the Print Media</b>	<b>1378</b>
<b>a. Strengths and Weaknesses of the Designated Exceptions Approach</b>	<b>1378</b>
<b>b. Limits of the Fair Use Approach</b>	<b>1382</b>
<b>i. Inherent Methodological Uncertainties</b>	<b>1382</b>
<b>ii. Outer Limits of the Case-by-Case Approach</b>	<b>1386</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>2. The Coup de Grâce: Digital Locks and Database Protection Laws</b>	<b>1387</b>
<b>a. Virtual Elimination of Limitations and Exceptions Favoring Science in the Online Environment</b>	<b>1389</b>
<b>b. Exclusive Rights in Noncopyrightable Collections of Data</b>	<b>1390</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>II. Empowering Digitally Integrated Scientific Research on a Global Scale</b>	<b>1394</b>
<b>A. Automated Knowledge Discovery Tools as Instruments of Massive Infringement</b>	<b>1395</b>
<b>B. The Limits of Incremental Legislative Reform to Alleviate Obstacles to Scientific Research</b>	<b>1396</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>1. Possible Reforms of Domestic Copyright Laws</b>	<b>1397</b>
<b>a. Improving the Information Society Directive         in the European Union</b>	<b>1398</b>
<b>b. Improving the Fair Use Approach</b>	<b>1400</b>



# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>2. What E-science Really Needs from Any Legislative Reform</b>	<b>1403</b>
<b>a. A Broad Exemption for Scientific Research as Such</b>	<b>1403</b>
<b>b. Breaking the Digital Locks</b>	<b>1404</b>
<b>c. Disciplining Contractual Overrides</b>	<b>1408</b>
<b>d. Aligning Database Protection Laws with Broad Exceptions for Science in Copyright Law</b>	<b>1409</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>C. Adjusting the International Legal Framework to Accommodate the Needs of Science</b>	<b>1411</b>
<b>1. Reinterpreting the Three-Step Test</b>	<b>1411</b>
<b>2. Leveraging the WIPO Development Agenda</b>	<b>1413</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>III. Enabling E-Science to Manage Its Own Upstream Research Assets</b>	<b>1414</b>
<b>A. Reassessing the Role of Publishing Intermediaries</b>	<b>1416</b>
<b>1. Costs and Benefits of the Traditional Approach</b>	<b>1416</b>
<b>2. The Proper Role of Publishing Intermediaries under Current Institutional Constraints</b>	<b>1419</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>B. Funders' Ability to Contractually Regulate Access, Use, and Reuse of Scientific Literature and Data</b>	<b>1421</b>
<b>C. Integrating the Intermediaries' Functions into Transnational Digital Knowledge Environments</b>	<b>1423</b>

# **Table of Contents *(continued)***

<b>Final Observations</b>	<b>1425</b>
<b>A. Bridging the Disconnect Between Private Rights and Public Science</b>	<b>1426</b>
<b>B. Reconciling the Goals of Innovation Policy with the Needs of Science Policy</b>	<b>1427</b>

# **Information Society Directive**

## **Article 5: Exceptions and limitations**

**3. Member States may provide for exceptions or limitations to the rights provided for in Articles 2 and 3 in the following cases:**

**(a) Use for the sole purpose of illustration for teaching or scientific research, as long as the source, including the author's name, is indicated, unless this turns out to be impossible and to the extent justified by the non-commercial purpose to be achieved;**

# **Information Society Directive**

## **Article 5: Exceptions and limitations**

- 2. Member States may provide for exceptions or limitations to the reproduction right provided for in Article 2 in the following cases:**
  - (b) In respect of reproductions on any medium made by a natural person for private use and for ends that are neither directly nor indirectly commercial, on condition that the rightholders receive fair compensation which takes account of the application or non-application of technological measures referred to in Article 6 to the work or subject-matter concerned;**

# **Information Society Directive**

## **Article 5: Exceptions and limitations**

- 5. The exceptions and limitations provided for in paragraphs 1, 2, 3 and 4 shall only be applied in certain special cases which do not conflict with a normal exploitation of the work or other subject-matter and do not unreasonably prejudice the legitimate interests of the rightholder.**



# **TRIPS Agreement, Part II**

## **Article 13**

### **Limitations and Exceptions**

**Members shall confine limitations or exceptions to exclusive rights to certain special cases which do not conflict with a normal exploitation of the work and do not unreasonably prejudice the legitimate interests of the right holder.**

## **Matthew Sag:**

**“Non-expressive, nonsubstitutional uses, in conjunction with copy-reliant technologies, should normally qualify as fair uses across the board, especially if relevant technologies can recognize and implement ‘opt in’ conditions.”**