Joseph R. Grodin

Distinguished Emeritus Professor, U.C. Hastings

Former Associate Justice, California Supreme Court

A Brief History of Public Sector Labor Relations Feb. 6, 2014

(or: Today’s Wisdom is Tomorrow’s Folly)

Dark Ages: Unions are totally inappropriate in the public sector:

* They are inconsistent with public sovereignty
* Collective bargaining would undermine democratic control
* Unions mean strikes, and strikes are intolerable

Englightenment (Sort Of): Public sector workers should have the right to organize, but:

* No bargaining, just conferring
* No exclusive representation
* No union security
* Strikes prohibited
* No grievance arbitration

Revolution: The public sector should look just like the private sector (almost)

* Duty to Bargain
* Exclusive representation within designated bargaining units
* Agency shop
* Grievance arbitration accepted
* Strikes maybe, except for essential services and then interest arb.
* Oversight through administrative agency

Counter-Revolution: The public sector is really, really different from the private sector:

* Public sector unions have too much power
* Public needs to be protected from results, especially pensions
* Public employees need to be protected from unions
* (This means no exclusive representation, no agency shop)
* Public needs to be protected from strikes and arbitrators

References:

-Wellington & Winter, “The Unions and the Cities”; “The Limits of Collective Bargaining in the Public Sector, 78 Yale L. J. 1123 (1969)

- Summers, “Bargaining in the Government’s Business”, 18 U. of Toledo L. Rev. 265 (1987)

- Grodin, “Public Employee Bargaining in California”, 23 Hast. L.J. 719 (1972); “Political Aspects of Public Sector Interest Arbitration”, 1 Ind. Rel. Law Q. 1 (1976)

- County Sanitation Dist. v. SEIU, 38 Cal. 3d 564 (1985)

- Keefe, “A Reconsideration and Empirical Evaluation of Welling & Winter’s “The Unions and the Cities” (2013)

- Malin, “Does Public Employee Bargaining Distort Democracy”, 34 Comp. Lab. L. & Policy J. 277 (2013)