

# Complicity

Ethics and Law for a Collective Age

CHRISTOPHER KUTZ  
*University of California at Berkeley*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK <http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk>  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA <http://www.cup.org>  
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Christopher Kutz 2000

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Palatino 10/13 pt. System MagnaType™ [AG]

*A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*  
Kutz, Christopher.

Complicity : ethics and law for a collective age / Christopher Kutz.  
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and law)

Originally presented as the author's thesis (doctoral) – University of California,  
Berkeley.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-59452-9 (hb)

1. Law and ethics. 2. Guilt (Law) 3. Responsibility. 4. Collectivism. I. Title. II. Series.  
K247.6.K88 2000

340'.112 – dc21 99-057892

ISBN 0 521 59452 9 hardback

*For my mother*

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
1 Introduction	1
2 The Deep Structure of Individual Accountability	17
2.1 Introduction	17
2.2 Social accountability as an example of the fundamentally relational nature of accountability	20
2.3 The relational bases of moral accountability: conduct, consequences, and character	25
2.4 A complication: the dynamics of accountability	46
2.5 The irreducibility of accountability	49
2.6 Ethical functionalism without consequentialism	53
2.7 Nietzsche's challenge	56
2.8 Legal accountability and the limits of response	59
2.9 Conclusion	64
3 Acting Together	66
3.1 Introduction	66
3.2 Methodology: generality, reducibility, and functionalism	68
3.3 Collective action as intentional participation	74
3.4 The contributory content of participatory intentions	81
3.5 The reducibility of collective action to individual intention	85
3.6 Collective action: the minimalist approach	89
3.7 Participation and the perspective of command	96
3.8 Ascribing collective actions	103
3.9 Attributing collective intentions	107

## Contents

3.10 Conclusion	112
4 Moral Accountability and Collective Action	113
4.1 Introduction	113
4.2 Common sense and the disappearance of moral accountability: Dresden	115
4.3 The inadequacy of moral theory to collective wrongdoing: individual consequentialism	124
4.4 The incompatibility of collective consequentialism and individual accountability	129
4.5 Kantian universalization and marginal contributions	133
4.6 Understanding collective action and individual accountability	138
4.7 Conclusion	144
5 Complicitous Accountability	146
5.1 Introduction	146
5.2 Whether complicit actors are less culpable than direct actors	147
5.3 Conclusion	164
6 Problematic Accountability: Facilitation, Unstructured Collective Harm, and Organizational Dysfunction	166
6.1 Introduction	166
6.2 Complicity without participation	168
6.3 Collective accountability and holistic responses	191
6.4 Conclusion	202
7 Complicity, Conspiracy, and Shareholder Liability	204
7.1 Introduction	204
7.2 Epistemic constraints upon legal accountability	206
7.3 Criminal complicity doctrine and the scope of liability	209
7.4 Justifying complicitous accountability	220
7.5 Against the limited civil liability of shareholders	236
7.6 Conclusion	253
8 Conclusion: Accountability and the Possibility of Community	254
<i>Notes</i>	261
<i>Bibliography</i>	311
<i>Index</i>	325

## Acknowledgments

This book began its life as a doctoral dissertation, and so is itself a project both individual and collective. I am grateful to the members of my graduate advisory committee, Samuel Scheffler, Bernard Williams, Kwong-loi Shun, and Jeremy Waldron, for their keen and generous guidance. Sam Scheffler was an ideal advisor and model of a professional philosopher, unstinting in patience, constructive criticism, and inspiration.

The Department of Philosophy at Berkeley provided an extremely happy environment during my graduate education, both institutionally and personally. Steve Arkonovich, Donald Davidson, Stephen Neale, and John Searle all read and commented upon parts of this book. I am especially grateful to Michael Green, who read most of the manuscript, for his insight and encouragement. My teachers at Yale Law School were kind in harboring a student whose interests ran more to theory than doctrine. I especially thank Jules Coleman and Owen Fiss for offering me their wisdom and mentorship.

I am wealthy in philosophically minded colleagues at Boalt Hall in general, and in the Jurisprudence and Social Policy Program in particular. I have drawn deeply on their counsel, friendship, and criticism. I thank Robert Cooter, Meir Dan-Cohen, Lauren Edelman, Andrew Guzmán, Sanford Kadish, David Lieberman, and Eric Rakowski, who have saved my discussion from many errors, doctrinal, practical, and philosophical. Michael Bratman and Derek Parfit have set another model for me, both in their own work and in the generosity they displayed toward an unknown student who applied to them for their responses. Peter Levine's thoughtful comments have improved Chapter 2. I am also grateful to David Franklin, Mark

### *Acknowledgments*

Kingwell, Martin Putnam, Seana Shiffrin, and Kevin Stack for many important discussions. Anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press and *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* provided exemplary readings, both probing and constructive. Mark Antaki provided crucial help with the index and proofs.

Ruth Kutz has been constantly generous in her support and encouragement, as have Robert Kutz, Daniel Greenberg, Pat Salt, Myra Jehlen, and Carl Riskin. Jessica Riskin has been my most uncompromising critic, felicitous editor, and inspiring interlocutor.

The Charlotte W. Newcombe Foundation provided crucial support during the writing of the dissertation as did the University of California Regents.

Christopher Kutz  
Berkeley, California

Material from the following previously published article is incorporated within: Christopher Kutz. "Acting Together," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* (July 2000).